The Critical AI Journal Style Guide comprises three parts: (1) a style sheet listing elements of style and format particular to the journal; (2) starting on page 3 of this guide, the Critical AI Journal Style Guide, which offers general rules for the journal based on The Chicago Manual of Style, 17th ed. (CMS); and (3) starting on page 9, an explanation with examples of the journal’s format for citations and reference list or bibliography.

**Critical AI Journal Style Sheet**

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**
Acknowledgments, written in the first person, appear as an unnumbered footnote.

The authors thank Grace Hopper, Katherine Johnson, and Margaret Hamilton for comments on earlier drafts of this work, as well as the organizers and attendees of the NeurIPS 2020 Workshop on ML Retrospectives, Surveys, and Meta-Analyses for providing an early venue for this work.

**EPIGRAPHS**
An epigraph, which may appear at the start of an article or a section, has an attribution that includes the author’s name or the author’s name and the work’s title. No other bibliographical information is required, and the source is not included in the works cited list unless it is cited elsewhere in the text. No footnote should be attached to an epigraph.

I never am really satisfied that I understand anything; because, understand it well as I may, my comprehension can only be an infinitesimal fraction of all I want to understand about the many connections and relations which occur to me, how the matter in question was first thought of or arrived at… Ada Lovelace, *Letters*

**REVIEWS AND REVIEW ESSAYS**
Book reviews do not have a title. The head matter contains the book’s title, the author’s or editor’s name, the facts of publication, and the number of pages. The reviewer’s name appears in the contributor’s note at the end of the review.


Review essays do have a title, which appears above the head matter, along with the byline. The books under review are listed in the order in which they are discussed.

*An AI Loop that Ensnares Consumers and Critics Alike*
Gabriel Nicholas


**GLOSSARY**

artificial intelligence (AI)
Bayesian networks
critical AI studies
data stores
data set
“democratize” / “democratization”
deep learning (DL)
digital data
GPT-3 / GPT-2
large language model (LLM)
machine learning (ML)
  data-derived machine learning (where appropriate)
“neural” network (NN)
posthuman
“scraping”

**ABBREVIATIONS**

Corporate, municipal, national, and supranational abbreviations and acronyms appear in full caps. Most initialisms (abbreviations pronounced as strings of letters) are preceded by *the*. Always use *US* as an adjective and *United States* as a noun.

- further expansion of NATO’s membership
- dissent within the AFL-CIO
- sexism is rampant at IBM
- certain US constituencies

Spell out Latin abbreviations such as *i.e.*, *e.g.*, and *etc.* in the text, though allow abbreviations within parentheses in the text. Allow abbreviations in notes. When used, these abbreviations are set in roman type, not italics. The word *sic*, however, is italicized.

Personal initials have periods and are spaced.

- W. E. B. Du Bois; C. D. Wright

**ABSTRACTS**

Substantial articles should include an abstract of approximately 200 words. Book reviews and short issue introductions do not require abstracts.

Abstracts should be written in the third person (“This article proposes . . .”), not the first person (“I propose . . .”).

**CAPITALIZATION. See also SPELLING AND HYPHENATION**

See CMS, chap. 8, for general guidance on capitalization.

In Romance and other languages, use diacritics with capital letters.

**After a Colon**

If the material introduced by a colon consists of more than one sentence, or if it is a quotation or a speech in dialogue, it should begin with a capital letter. Otherwise, it begins with a lowercase letter. See CMS 6.63.
Quotations
Silently correct initial capitalization in quotations depending on the relationship of the quotation to the rest of the sentence (see CMS 13.19). For instance:

Smith stated that “we must carefully consider all aspects of the problem.”

but

Smith stated, “We must carefully consider all aspects of the problem.”

A lowercase letter following a period plus an ellipsis should be capitalized if it begins a grammatically complete sentence (CMS 13.53).

The spirit of our American radicalism is destructive. . . . The conservative movement . . . is timid, and merely defensive of property.

Terms
A down (lowercase) style is generally preferred for terms. See CMS, chap. 8, for detailed guidelines on capitalization of terms.

Titles of Works
For titles in English, capitalize the first and last words and all nouns, pronouns, adjectives, verbs, adverbs, and subordinating conjunctions (if, because, that, etc.). Lowercase articles (a, an, the), coordinating conjunctions, and prepositions (regardless of length). The to in infinitives and the word as in any function are lowercased.

For hyphenated and open compounds in titles in English, capitalize first elements; subsequent elements are capitalized unless they are articles, prepositions, or coordinating conjunctions. Subsequent elements attached to prefixes are lowercased unless they are proper nouns. The second element of hyphenated spelled-out numbers or simple fractions should be capitalized. If a compound (other than one with a hyphenated prefix) comes at the end of the title, its final element is always capitalized.

Nineteenth-Century Literature
Avoiding a Run-In
Policies on Re-creation
Reading the Twenty-Third Psalm

When titles contain direct quotations, the headline-capitalization style described above and in CMS should be imposed.

“We All Live More like Brutes than Humans”: Labor and Capital in the Gold Rush

In capitalizing titles in any non-English language, including French, capitalize the first letter of the title and subtitle and all proper nouns. See CMS 11.70 and 11.39 for the
treatment of Dutch and German titles, respectively. Diacritical marks on capital letters are retained in all languages.

CONTRIBUTOR’S NOTE

Each contributor’s note includes the author’s name, rank, affiliation, areas of activity or research, and most recent works. Dates of publication, but not publishers’ names, are given for books.

Rebecca Newman is professor of history at the University of Chicago. She is author of In the Country of the Last Emperor (1991).

Yingjin Zhang teaches Chinese literature at Indiana University. His book Configurations of the City in Modern Chinese Literature is forthcoming.

DATES AND TIMES. See also NUMBERS

For more information, see CMS 9.29–38.

May 1968
May 1, 1968
May 1–3, 1968
on February 8, 1996, at 8:15 a.m. and again at 6:15 p.m.
September–October 1992
from 1967 to 1970
1960s counterculture; sixties [not 60s or ’60s] counterculture
the 1980s and 1990s
mid-1970s American culture
the mid-nineteenth century [note hyphen, not en dash]
the late twentieth century; late twentieth-century Kenya
the years 1896–1900, 1900–1905, 1906–9, 1910–18
“The Audacity of His Enterprise: Louis Riel and the Métis Nation That Canada Never Was, 1840–1875” [use full year range in titles of works and headings]
AD 873; the year 640 BC; Herod Antipas (21 BCE–39 CE) [use full caps without periods for era designations]
ca. 1820

EXTRACTS. See also CAPITALIZATION and PUNCTUATION (Ellipses)

Set off quotations that are more than 400 characters (including spaces) in length.
FIGURES AND TABLES

Each figure or table should be referred to either parenthetically (figure is abbreviated as fig. when referenced parenthetically) or in running text at a relevant place in the discussion. Number tables and figures consecutively.

The pressure of the flow repeatedly threatened to break down the walls that had just been created by cooling (fig. 3).

As figure 1 shows, our labor took the form of designing supported experiences for GTAs.

The problem with school attendance in the Bronx (see table 1) is largely the fault of a social system that neglects its children.

Figure Captions
Captions take sentence-style capitalization and have terminal punctuation. If credit or source information is provided, it should be the last element of the caption.

Figure 1. The author with unidentified friend, 1977.
Figure 2. The author posed for this picture with an unidentified friend in 1977.
Figure 3. Noam Chomsky at a political rally, 1971. Courtesy of John Allan Cameron Archives, University of Florida, Gainesville.
Figure 4. Coal miners in Matewan, West Virginia, April 1920. The miners’ strike was depicted in John Sayles’s film Matewan. Photograph courtesy of Matewan Historical Society.
Figure 5. Winston Roberts, *When Last I Saw* (1893). Oil on canvas, 56 × 48 in. Courtesy of the Campbell Collection, Central State Community College Library, Pleasance, Nebraska.
Figure 6. Harvey Nit, *These. These? Those!* (2011). Mascara on cocktail napkin, 16 × 16 cm. © Harvey Nit.

Table Titles
Table titles take sentence-style capitalization but do not have terminal punctuation.

Table 3. Comparative frequency of bicycles, mopeds, and Segways in Amsterdam, Dublin, and Toronto, 2005–2015

GRAMMAR

A split infinitive is OK if the text reads better with a split infinitive.

Make a distinction between *that* (restrictive) and *which* (nonrestrictive) but not obsessively (i.e., if making the distinction means that there will be several *ths* in a row, allow a restrictive *which*).

Maintain parallel structure.
Maintain subject-verb agreement and tense consistency.

INCLUSIVE LANGUAGE

Avoid sexist language and terms that are gender specific (chairman, mankind, etc.). Use gender-neutral alternatives, including recasting to plural or using singular they, rather than he or she constructions. Never allow the form s/he. Avoid alternating the use of masculine and feminine pronouns in an article. See CMS 5.251–60 (bias-free language), especially 5.255–56, and 5.48 (singular they).

However, there may be times when the generic masculine pronoun or gendered language is appropriate or preferred by the author: for example, in discussions of works of philosophy in which the original author used he, him, man, and the like generically, or if the article’s author intentionally uses female pronouns exclusively or uses alternative pronouns such as ze.

INITIALS. See ABBREVIATIONS

KEYWORDS. See also ABSTRACTS

Articles that include an abstract should also include three to five keywords. Keywords should be lowercase (except for names or titles that would otherwise be capitalized) and separated by commas.

Keywords negative affect, self-portrait, Del LaGrace Volcano, intersex, Polaroid photography

NOTES. See also the section on documentation below.

Avoid callouts for footnotes or endnotes in article titles, in heads, at the ends of epigraphs, or in figure captions.

Wherever possible, place note callouts at the end of a sentence, or at least at the end of a clause.

Callouts for footnotes in tables are handled separately. Each table has its own set of notes. See the journal’s style sheet for guidance on the format used for callouts (e.g., lowercase letters, numerals, or symbols). See also CMS 3.79.

NUMBERS. See also DATES AND TIMES

Cardinal and ordinal whole numbers from one to ninety-nine (and such numbers followed by hundred, thousand, million, billion, etc.), any number at the beginning of a sentence, and common fractions are spelled out. Common fractions are hyphenated as well. See CMS, chap. 9.

no fewer than six of the eight victims
One hundred eighty-seven people were put to death there during the twenty-third century BC. 

attendance was about ninety thousand  

at least two-thirds of the electorate  

there were two million ballots cast  

the population will top between 27.5 and 28 billion

Numbers applicable to the same category, however, are treated alike in the same context.

no fewer than 6 of the 113 victims  

Almost twice as many people voted Republican in the 115th precinct as in the 23rd.

Numbers that express decimal quantities, dollar amounts, and percentages are written as figures.

an average of 2.6 years  

now estimated at 1.1 billion inhabitants  

more than $56, or 8 percent of the petty cash  

a decline of $0.30 per share

Inclusive page numbers are given as follows (per CMS 9.61):  

1–2, 3–11, 74–75, 100–103, 104–9, 112–15, 414–532, 505–16, 600–612, 1499–1501

Roman numerals are used in the pagination of preliminary matter in books, in family names and the names of monarchs and other leaders in a succession, in the names of world wars, in legal instruments, and in the titles of certain sequels.

On page iii Bentsen sets out his agenda.

Neither John D. Rockefeller IV, Elizabeth II, nor John Paul II was born before World War I.  

Yet Title XII was meant to rectify not only inequities but iniquities.

Most critics consider The Godfather, Part II a better movie than Jaws 2. [Follow the usage in the original work, per CMS 9.43.]

Arabic numerals are used for the parts of books.

In part 2, chapter 2, of volume 11 of the Collected Works, our assumptions are overturned.
POSSESSIVES

The possessive of nouns ending with the letter s are formed by adding an apostrophe and an s (CMS 7.17).

- Burns’s poetry
- Camus’s novels
- Descartes’s philosophy
- Euripides’s plays
- Jesus’s name

PUNCTUATION

En and Em Dashes
See CMS 6.75–92. Use real en and em dashes to indicate en and em dashes in the manuscript.

- 115–36
- post–Civil War era
- The United States’ hegemony—that is, its domination of other nations—is increasing.

Ellipses. See also CAPITALIZATION (Quotations)
Three dots indicate an ellipsis within a sentence or fragment; a period plus three dots indicates an ellipsis between grammatically complete sentences, even when the end of the first sentence in the original source has been omitted. In general, ellipses are not used at the start of a quotation (whether it begins with a grammatically complete sentence or not) or at the end of a quotation (if it ends with a grammatically complete sentence), unless the ellipses serve a definite purpose. See CMS 13.50–58 for more detailed guidelines on the use of ellipses.

Hyphens. See SPELLING AND HYPHENATION

QUOTATIONS. See EXTRACTS

RACIAL AND ETHNIC TERMS

Capitalize terms used to identify people of color or of historically marginalized origins (e.g., Black, Indigenous). As a rule, do not capitalize terms used to identify people outside these groups (e.g., white). Do not capitalize of color constructions (e.g., people of color, women of color). Exceptions are allowed if the author insists or if the author’s text would be, in the editor’s view and with the author’s concurrence, well served by alternative treatment. The list that follows is intended to be illustrative, not comprehensive.

- Aborigine, Aboriginal
BIPOC [Black, Indigenous, and People of Color]
Black, Blackness, anti-Black, anti-Blackness
Brown
First Nations
Indigenous, Indigeneity
Native
white, whiteness

SPELLING AND HYPHENATION

Follow the online Merriam-Webster’s Collegiate Dictionary (https://www.merriam-webster.com) and Webster’s Third New International Dictionary for spelling. If more than one spelling is provided in the dictionary, follow the first form given (e.g., judgment, not judgement; focused, not focussed).

For further guidance regarding the hyphenation of compound words, see CMS 7.89.

Common foreign terms are set in roman type. (Common foreign terms are defined as those with main entries and not classified as “foreign term” in Webster’s.)

Prefixes are hyphenated before numerals and proper nouns. Otherwise, prefixes are generally not hyphenated before words; refer to Webster’s for guidance. Temporary compound adjectives are hyphenated before the noun to avoid ambiguity but are left open after the noun. Non-English phrases used as modifiers are open in any position, unless hyphenated in the original.

Put neologisms within quotation marks at first use.

A term referred to as the term itself is italicized.

In the twentieth century socialism acquired many meanings.
The word hermeneutics is the most overused term in recent monographs.
The term lyricism was misused in Smith’s book review.

TABLES. See FIGURES AND TABLES and NOTES

TRANSLATIONS. See also the section on documentation below.

Non-English Titles with English Translation
When an original non-English title and its translation appear together in the text, the first version (whether original or translation) takes the form of an original title, and the second version is always enclosed in parentheses and treated like a published title
(whether or not the work represents a published translation; contra CMS 11.9) with title capitalization appropriate to the language.

I read Mi nombre es Roberto (My Name Is Roberto) in 1989.
I read My Name Is Roberto (Mi nombre es Roberto) in 1989.

Rubén Darío’s poem “Azul” (“Blue”) is one of my favorites.
Rubén Darío’s poem “Blue” (“Azul”) is one of my favorites.

**URLs. See also the section on documentation below.**

Use complete URLs when they appear in articles (notes, references, and main text). Include the protocol (https or http) and trailing slash (if it is part of the URL). DOIs appearing in notes and reference lists are presented as complete URLs. See CMS 14:10 for advice on shortening excessively long URLs.

https://doi.org/10.1215/00982601-9467191
https://georgianpapers.com/research-funding/transcription/
This journal uses **author-date citations in the text** with a corresponding reference list of works cited at the end of the article.

Notes may also include material that cannot be conveniently presented in the text, such as discursive adjuncts and additional sources of information. Any material necessary for understanding the argument set forth in the article should appear in the text.

The notations f. (ff.), ibid., op. cit., and loc. cit. are not used, nor are eadem, idem, infra, passim, and supra. Commonly used abbreviations include cf., ed. (eds.), e.g., esp., et al., etc., fig. (figs.), fol. (fols.), i.e., n. (nn.), p. (pp.), pt. (pts.), ser., trans., vol. (vols.). Latin abbreviations are not italicized. Note that in et al., et is a whole word (meaning “and”) and therefore is not followed by a period. In references to poetry, where the abbreviation “l.” or “ll.” might be mistaken for a numeral, the word “line” or “lines” is spelled out.

The reference list at the end of the article contains only works cited. References are arranged alphabetically by author, then chronologically in ascending order. For multiple references by the same author, the author’s name is repeated; 3-em dashes are not used. In titles of works, serial commas are added, ampersands are spelled out, and numbers are spelled out. URLs, including for DOIs, use “https://” to ensure that links work online (CMS 14.7). For additional guidelines concerning the treatment of titles, see **CAPITALIZATION** in the Duke University Press Journals Style Guide.

**Sample Reference List Items**

**BOOK**

Langford, Gerald. 1971. *Faulkner’s Revision of “Absalom, Absalom!”: A Collation of the Manuscript and the Published Book*. Austin: University of Texas Press. [A book title within a book title is quoted and italicized (CMS 14.94). A main title ending in an exclamation point or a question mark is followed by a colon only if the question mark or exclamation point appears within quotation marks (CMS 14.96).]


Smith, John. 2011. *All Tongue-Tied and Nowhere to Go; or, How to Save Face When They Put You on the Spot*. Vail, CO: Slippery Slopes. [Treatment of double titles, contra the preferred form in CMS 8.167]

**E-BOOK**


Weinstein, Donald. 1989. “The Art of Dying Well and Popular Piety in the Preaching and Thought of Girolamo Savonarola.” In Tetel, Witt, and Goffen 1989: 88–104. [A shortened form is used for chapters from collections that are also included in the reference list.]


Williams, Theodore. (1905) 1974. The Art of Porcelain during the Late Ming Dynasty. New York: Grove. [For reprint editions, the date of first publication may be supplied parenthetically, followed by the date of the reprint (CMS 15.40). Both dates appear in the corresponding citation.]


Dachuan, Sun. 1991. Jiujiu jiu yici (One Last Cup of Wine). Taipei: Zhang Laoshi Chubanshe. [This form is recommended for works in languages relatively unfamiliar to the journal’s expected readership. The translated title uses italics and headline capitalization (contra CMS 11.9)—in other words, it is treated as if it named a published translation even if it does not.]


MULTIAUTHOR WORK


Gustafson, Albert K., Jonas Edwards, Ezra Best, and Nathan Wise. 1985. *If I Were a Rich Man: Comparative Studies of Urban and Rural Poverty*. Murfey, WI: Fore and Aft. [If there are ten authors or fewer, all are listed by name; if more than ten, the first is listed by name, followed by “et al.” (CMS 14.76).]

ANONYMOUS WORK. See also UNSIGNED ARTICLE

*A True and Sincere Declaration of the Purpose and Ends of the Plantation Begun in Virginia, of the Degrees Which It Hath Received, and Means by Which It Hath Been Advanced*. 1610. London. [The title appears in place of the author; “Anonymous” or “Anon.” is not used. For purposes of alphabetization an initial article is ignored (CMS 14.79).]

UNDATED WORK


Sales, Robert. n.d. *Victory at Sea: Being a True Account of the Recent Destruction of an Infamous Foreign Fleet*. Dublin. [Note that the “n” in “n.d.” is not capitalized (CMS 14.145).]

REFERENCE WORK


JOURNAL ARTICLE, PRINT

Meban, David. 2008. “Temple Building, *Primus* Language, and the Proem to Virgil’s Third *Georgic*.” *Classical Philology* 103, no. 2: 150–74. [Journal published in volumes; the month or season is not required. As a courtesy to readers who consult articles online, issue numbers should be given if available.]


JOURNAL ARTICLE, ONLINE


REVIEW

Jameson, Fredric. 1991. “The Historian as Body-Snatcher.” Review of Learning to Curse: Essays in Early Modern Culture, by Stephen J. Greenblatt. Times Literary Supplement, January 18, 7. [Page numbers are not needed in citations of or references to newspapers (CMS 14.191) but may be included in citations of or references to supplements and other special sections (CMS 14.197).]

SPECIAL ISSUE, and ARTICLE IN SPECIAL ISSUE


MAGAZINE ARTICLE


NEWSPAPER ARTICLE, PRINT


NEWSPAPER ARTICLE, ONLINE


UNSIGNED ARTICLE


DISSERTATION


Noah Fence (pers. comm., April 1, 2014) speculated on the pitfalls of having a play on words for a name. [References to such communications as emails or private messages shared on social media often can be run in to the text, without need of note or reference (CMS 14.214).]

Jacques Petits Fours (provost, Upper Midwestern University), interview by author, Ames, IA, February 20, 1995. [Interviews or other personal communications in which more information than the date is pertinent may appear in a note (CMS 14.214).]


Author-Date Citations

This system uses in-text citations—usually enclosed in parentheses and comprising the author’s surname (with first initial if ambiguous), the date, and the pages cited—and a reference list at the end of the article contains the complete bibliographic information of the works cited. See the sample references immediately above. For multiple references by the same author, the author’s name is repeated; 3-em dashes are not used. Note that in the author-date system, works published in the same year by the same author must be labeled “a,” “b,” and so on for clarity.

The witnesses had been, one observer surmised, tampered with (Northrup 1957: 3). [The date and page number are separated by a colon, not a comma (contra CMS 15.9).]

As Sylvia Molloy (1991: 43) observes, “The previous letter, marked by subservience, waived Manzano’s rights to the text by ‘giving’ it to del Monte; the second letter, marked instead by resistance, has Manzano keep the text for himself.” [The date and page number appear immediately after the author, not at the end of the sentence, if he or she is named in the sentence (CMS 15.25).]

25. Wert (1984: 115–17) insists that his predecessors’ conclusions were the merest speculation (see M. McLain 1981; P. McLain 1981). [No note should consist solely of an author-date citation, but discursive notes may contain author-date citations.]

If more than one work by the same author is cited, the author’s name is not repeated.

(Wilson 1963, 1974)
(Miller 1978: 267; 1994)

For works by more than three authors, only the surname of the first author is used, followed by et al.

not (Cobb, Hornsby, Ott, and Smith 1982) but (Cobb et al. 1982)

If there is no author, use the shortened title or publication title in the author position in the reference.

(New Yorker 1974)

If there is no date, n.d. is used.

(McGarry n.d.)

If the work is meant, rather than the author, the parentheses are omitted.

Medwick 1924 remains the standard reference.
If the citation is to a reprint edition, the original date of publication should be cited first, in brackets within a parenthetical citation and in parentheses not within a parenthetical citation (e.g., in a note). See CMS 15.40.

(Williams [1905] 1974: 41)

1. For a more in-depth discussion of this point, see Williams (1905) 1974.

To refer again to the most recently cited source, a page number is used.

The sperm whale, Beale (1839: 46) concluded in *The Natural History of the Sperm Whale*, is “remarkably timid, and is readily alarmed by the approach of a whale boat.” Beale noted that “it is difficult to conceive any object in nature calculated to cause alarm to this leviathan” (46).

When one volume of a multivolume work is cited, the volume number is indicated after the date.

(Koufax 1973, 1:223)

To cite an unnumbered note, the abbreviation n or nn follows the page number without an intervening space. With numbered notes, the note number or numbers follow the abbreviation without intervening period or space (CMS 14.157).

(Javitch 2010: 385n; Adams 2009: 5n10, 8nn20–21)

Personal communications, such as telephone conversations, email messages, and nonarchived letters, are identified as “pers. comm.” and dated in the text but are not included in the reference list.

Wilson (pers. comm., March 13, 2007) proved the hypothesis false.

When “emphasis added,” “my translation,” and the like are used, they come after a quotation:

According to Brodsky (1990: 257), “Marcus Aurelius was one of the *greatest* men who ever lived” (emphasis added). [Emphasis in quoted material is assumed to match the original source unless otherwise stated; omit notes such as “original emphasis.”]

When an author’s name doesn’t appear in the text, it’s best to have the citation before the final mark of punctuation:

Many scholars and poets believe that Marcus Aurelius was one of the greatest men in history (see, e.g., Brodsky 1990: 257; Patterson 1996: 112).
If the journal follows the author-date system, make sure to differentiate between authors and works. For example: “In Smith 1980, there is . . .” or “Smith (1980) argues that there is . . .”

Citing Works Whose Authors Have Changed Names

Sometimes, a cited author’s affirmed name differs from the name on the work cited. In these cases, use the author’s affirmed name when discussing their published work in the text of an article or book. We also recommend using the affirmed name in citations:

Text/note discussion As {Affirmed name} wrote, “Quote from cited author.”

However, if it is known that a cited author would like citations to their work to use the name on the publication, use the published name in the citation instead:

Text/note discussion As {Affirmed name} wrote, “Quote from cited author.”

In cases where the author deems it appropriate to include both names in a reference list item, we recommend listing the affirmed name first, followed in brackets by the name under which the work was originally published: